

Educators of Candidates' Fitness For Superintendency of N. Y. City Schools

Summary of Tribune Poll
Furnishes Data to Aid
in Selection

Seventy-eight Give
Reasons for Choice

Earnestness and Independence
Shown by Correspondents

THE TRIBUNE undertook an extensive poll of the leaders of education in the country in order to gather data as to the candidates and potential candidates for the superintendency of the New York City schools.

It argued that for a highly responsible and important position one naturally desires the best man; and that one way to find out who is the best man is to ask the people who know. And in any case it seemed desirable that the people of New York should have some knowledge of the situation.

The canvass had two chief purposes. To discover who, in the opinion of those competent to judge, is the best fitted man in the country for the New York superintendency; and to discover in the same way which of the local talents is best fitted, if the choice is to be confined to them.

Accordingly the questionnaire, the results of which were summarized in The Tribune Sunday, asked for nominations for the post of superintendency and for an expression of opinion as to the standing in the world of education of the eight Associate Superintendents of New York, from whom it was understood, the School Board intended to make its choice. These are: Andrew W. Edson, William L. Ettinger, Clarence E. Meloney, William McAndrew, Gustave Straubemiller, Edward B. Shallow, John L. Tildley and John H. Walsh.

More particularly the questionnaire invited the expression of personal opinion and of specific reasons for it. In this respect the results were especially encouraging. Most of the correspondents specified with evident conscientious care the reasons for their choices and opinions. It was clear that the educators of the country took New York's problem very seriously, indeed, whether local politicians choose to or not.

The earnestness and independence of the great majority of the correspondents seemed to justify the placing of much confidence in the results of the poll.

To two hundred school men outside of New York City questions were addressed. Of these, seventy-eight replied. The following is the list:

Superintendent Garber, Philadelphia.
Superintendent Condon, Cincinnati.
Superintendent Thurston, Washington.
Superintendent Beveridge, Omaha.
Superintendent Potter, Milwaukee.
Superintendent Francis, Columbus.
Superintendent Withers, St. Louis.
Superintendent Hughes, Syracuse.
Superintendent Van Sickle, Springfield, Mass.
Superintendent Weaver, Hartford.
Superintendent Chandler, Richmond.
Superintendent Lewis, Worcester.
Superintendent Emerson, Buffalo.
Professor Judd, University of Chicago.
Superintendent Mayberry, Wichita.
Superintendent Glass, Lynchburg.
Superintendent McDonald, Sioux Falls.
Superintendent Cole, Denver.
Superintendent Corson, Newark.
Superintendent Taylor, Manchester, N. H.
Superintendent Whitney, Everett, Mass.
Superintendent Moore, Leavenworth.
Superintendent Sheppard, Passaic.
Superintendent Martin, Bismarck, N. D.
Superintendent Knapp, Detroit.
Superintendent Fee, Cheyenne.
Superintendent Rogers, Pensacola.
Superintendent Lowther, Emporia.
Superintendent Hill, Colorado Springs.
Superintendent Gibson, Savannah.
Superintendent Laramy, Easton.
Superintendent Sowers, Douglas.
Superintendent Weber, Scranton.
Superintendent Geiger, Liverpool, N. Y.
Superintendent Greeson, Grand Rapids, Mich.
Superintendent Harris, Dubuque.
Superintendent Harper, Raleigh.
Superintendent Bliss, Montclair.
Superintendent Stanson, Ann Arbor.
Superintendent Perkins, Portland, Me.
Superintendent Horn, Houston.
Superintendent Ramsay, Fort Scott, Kans.
Superintendent Oberholzer, Tulsa, Okla.
Superintendent Hutchinson, Montpelier, Vt.
Superintendent Evans, Augusta, Ga.
Superintendent Newton, Lincoln, Neb.
Superintendent Robins, Bristol, Conn.
Superintendent Fassett, Nashua, N. H.
Superintendent Voorhes, Winona, Minn.

Superintendent Hanson, Burlington, Iowa.
Superintendent Shear, Poughkeepsie.
Superintendent Reid, Louisville.
Superintendent Munroe, Fairbault, Minn.

Superintendent Sirger, Dover, N. J.
Superintendent Scully, Brooklyn.
Superintendent Hartwell, Muskegon, Mich.

Superintendent Githens, Wheeling.
Superintendent Benetz, Evansville.
State Superintendent Ranger, Rhode Island.

State Superintendent Keeler, Michigan.
State Superintendent Butterfield, New Hampshire.

State Superintendent Carey, Wisconsin.
State Superintendent Morrison, Connecticut.

State Superintendent Payson Smith, Massachusetts.
F. L. Pinet, editor "Kansas Teachers' Association Journal."

Allen B. Pond, president Chicago Educational Association.
C. W. Bardeen, editor "School Bulletin."

S. Y. Gillan, editor "Western Teacher."
Frank H. Palmer, editor "Education."

C. W. Bleising, editor "American Education."
A. E. Winslow, editor "Journal of Education."

Each of the school men who replied modestly refrained from proposing himself as the "best fitted man."

Further, there was no evident tendency among the correspondents to play favorites. Where personal admiration for one or another candidate entered in it was clearly based on an enthusiasm for the man's work and achievement.

A complete tabulation of the comments on the nominated men, as well as on the associate superintendents of New York, is here for the first time published:

John H. Finley, State Commissioner of Education, N. Y.

1. A type above the ordinary detail, absorbed school officer, he would be recognized as a leader worthy of this great place.
2. His ability is native; his experience, education and character are all of the highest. He is a cultured gentleman who organizes and directs with enthusiasm.

3. He has reputation. He is known. He is best fitted because of his reputation.

4. He has ability and standing. He is used to handling problems of New York. He is a leader in his profession.

5. A man of fine executive ability, high educational ideals, warm human sympathy and master in his profession.

Charles E. Chadsey, Superintendent of Schools, Detroit.

1. He has made good in harder city jobs than any man in the United States.

2. He would measure well up to demands.

3. He is one of the best superintendents in the country. He has made a record of success in the Detroit schools. He manages well.

4. He is a business man, a thinker and not a politician.

5. He has advanced through all the grades of administration with success. He is a leader who knows the requirements of big cities and how to meet them.

6. He has ability, training, experience and success.

7. He has an excellent record, especially in Detroit. He has a well organized, scientifically tested system in which teachers are loyal and contented and patrons enthusiastic and cooperative.

8. He not only possesses most unusual powers as a corporate manager, but also all the qualities of a humanist with the technique of a genuine child-lover.

9. Exceptionally sound in policies and intelligent in carrying them out.

10. Ballot without comment.

Professor Charles H. Judd, University of Chicago

1. Because of his scholarship, detailed knowledge of the field of education, authority in that line and ability to make it clear to others.

2. He is the keenest and most scientific administrator in America.

Frank Dyer, Superintendent of Schools, Boston

1. Because he is well trained, rich in experience and has the reputation of being one of the most practical school men in the country.

2. He has an enviable record in Cincinnati, and likewise in Boston.

3. He is known by his work and by the confidence school men have in him. He has the power of leadership in a high degree; progressive, enthusiastic.

Andrew W. Edson, Associate Superintendent, New York

1. He has experience and character that command confidence.

2. He is an author and a lecturer.

3. He is safe and sane. He has no superior in professional ability and equipment.

4. His writings and addresses have made him favorably and widely known.

5. He has been in demand as superintendent and as college professor.

6. He is most highly regarded for the work he has done in conventions and summer schools.

7. He has done able work for the State of Massachusetts and the city of New York.

8. Because of his work in the National Education Association.

9. He is a practical supervisor of proved ability.

10. He's the good, conservative kind.

11. His reputation is excellent.

12. His long career in connection with New York schools has made him well known.

13. He has cultivated a wide acquaintance, is an aristocrat, but honest, outspoken, able and firm.

14. He has broad vision, sterling character, executive ability.

15. He is a keen school man and acquainted with New York educational subjects.

16. Why choose an outsider? Edson has the right spirit. He is a progressive without being too radical. He is not an advertiser. He combines professional skill with sound judgment.

17. A contributor to educational magazines, a speaker at teachers' conventions.

18. His reputation as a careful organizer makes him known.

19. A fine character, a master of elementary school problems, a good speaker.

20. Ballot without comment.

John H. Walsh, Associate Superintendent, New York

1. He has had long and successful experience in these schools and knows local conditions.

2. He is well known because of his arithmetics.

3. He is somewhat known through books.

4. He wrote an arithmetic, or a series of them.

5. An author of textbooks.

6. He has a good reputation for steady, efficient administration.

7. Ballot without comment.

C. N. Kendall, State Commissioner, New Jersey

1. His thorough ability and training are supplemented by varied experience in different parts of the country.

2. Schools took first rank in the nation when put under his supervision.

John L. Tildley, Associate Superintendent, New York

1. He has had the requisite training.

2. A courageous administrator, a successful high school principal, thoroughly trained in all phases.

3. Solid, substantial, thoroughgoing.

James E. Russell, Dean, Teachers College, New York

1. He would best meet the demands of the situation.

2. He is solid, substantial and thoroughgoing.

Clarence E. Meloney, Associate Superintendent, New York

1. He made a record by organizing power and general ability.

2. He once directed high schools.

3. He is locally known.

4. Known very favorably as a lecturer.

5. High personal integrity.

Philander P. Claxton, National Commissioner of Education

1. He has the best training the country affords. He has diplomacy, sound judgment and wonderful personality.

2. He is in touch with the best in the world, and from it has achieved a notable breadth of training.

William McAndrew, Associate Superintendent, New York

1. Knows local conditions; a man of ideal training in initiative, in executive ability and with a record of success.

2. Well known as author.

3. Capable, energetic, progressive. His broad and intimate acquaintance with school conditions in greater New York. His position as director of the Washington Irving School. His nationwide reputation as an educational leader. He stands for and represents the best in educational theory and practice.

4. He has exceptional imagination and vision and would probably make good as an administrator.

5. He knows New York, knows New York, understands that schools must be made a part of life.

6. He is progressive, courageous and fair. His past record suggests him for this place.

7. He is a progressive administrator. He is a splendid schoolman.

8. His report as division superintendent of Brooklyn is an educational classic. His views on modern educational associations are full of unusual merit.

9. He is known as author and administrator.

10. His writings and speeches have made him well known.

11. He is probably one of the greatest thinkers in education, one of the most forceful writers and thinkers.

12. He is a man to admire and respect; a little theoretical, but most progressive.

13. He is well known for his success in secondary education.

14. He is an all-round schoolman, with vision.

15. He did unusual work in the Washington Irving School, which makes him well known.

16. He is virile and has a punch that counts.

17. Available; well known by those who hear and read up-to-date educational contributions.

18. He is a man of originality, who does things.

19. He is a brilliant thinker and a well known contributor to the solution of educational problems.

20. He appears to be a good administrator. He has a keen eye for the defects of modern education and offers remedial measures.

21. He is best fitted for the superintendency because of what he has already done for New York and of the confidence school men have in him.

22. He is the champion of modern education. He has an intimate acquaintance with New York conditions and is well qualified to outline policies and to give reasons for them.

23. He knows local conditions. His experience covers high and elementary schools. He is in the prime of physical vigor and is a live wire.

24. He is original in his point of view, a forceful writer and speaker.

25. He is the best known schoolman in New York and impresses the outside world as a strong man.

26. For ability, brains, originality, training, initiative, sanity and success.

27. Because of his pleasing personality, good training and accurate scholarship.

28. Because of his progressive character. Probably he is too assertive for New York.

29. He seems most progressive and is the best known for his advanced ideas and sound doctrines. I have a slight knowledge of the nature of his "faults" and suppose he must have some.

30. His great work as principal, his pungent writings on education, have given him a high place in the educational world.

31. Because of his ability, his progressiveness and courage.

32. This man is first. Why need you go out of the city when you have such an administrator?

33. He is well and favorably known.

34. His work is constructive, with originality of view and expression.

35. Brilliant, original and radical; would serve as a model for all.

36. A rather brilliant speaker, a radical.

37. His high school work and his record on the platform make him known.

38. I don't know him personally, but he looks pretty good for the place.

39. He is one of the biggest educators of the times and, through experience, knows the New York schools.

40. A strong executive. He interprets education in terms of service to the community. He is inspiring.

41. Forceful and brilliant. I do not know how well balanced for so large a proposition. He has definite ideas and is attracted to teaching, but would make a success of anything.

42. Better known than any of the New York superintendents.

Frank E. Spaulding, Superintendent of Schools, Cleveland

1. His record marks him as the best. He is an organizer of high ability. He is progressive and varied in experience. New York needs a man like him who is broad, progressive and not afraid.

2. He is well trained, fearless, aggressive and not over sensitive. He has had an ideal experience for such a task.

3. He is one of the ablest school men in the country.

Gustave Straubemiller, Associate Superintendent, New York

1. He has a record as acting superintendent.

2. Because he is a good man.

3. As acting superintendent he has become well known over the country.

4. He is known because he has been acting superintendent.

5. He is an organizer with good judgment and scholarship.

6. Ballot without comment.

Payson Smith, State Commissioner, Massachusetts

1. He has vision, force, courage, tact and excellent judgment. He has had experience and a thorough education. He is universally respected in educational circles.

Thomas E. Finegan, Deputy State Commissioner, New York

1. He is a great executive. He knows school law, can handle men, has experience with large problems and influence with the department at Albany.

2. He is a man of thought, a scholar with the New York schools must be made a part of life.

Nilo E. Hellegas, State Superintendent of Schools, Vermont

1. He has clear vision, deliberate and sound judgment, firmness, definite policy, and is independent of political influence.

Henry Suzalo, President, University of the State of Washington

1. He is a great executive, a wonderful organizer and a thorough scholar. He has depth and poise.

Elwood P. Cubberly, Leland Stanford University

1. Appreiative, progressive, well balanced, an able organizer, broad-gauged, fearless, tactful and a good business man.

E. O. Holland, Washington State College

1. Widely known because of his natural capacity and his preparation.

George D. Strayer, Teachers College, New York

1. He is already the dean of school administration by virtue of his contributions to modern school methods. He has splendid personality and unusual executive ability.

2. He is well qualified by wide views of education in general.

3. He is the best prepared and most progressive.

4. His judgment, poise and his knowledge of school administration distinguish him.

5. His unusual and unquestionable equipment for the work in question. No one in the country is more fit.

Carlos M. Cole, Superintendent of Schools, Denver

1. Exceptional ability as an organizer; insight into school problems.

2. He is fearless, aggressive, and tactful.

J. A. C. Chandler, Superintendent of Schools, Richmond, Virginia

1. Because of rare, executive ability.

Henry C. Moggison, State Commissioner, Connecticut

1. He is a man of action and fearlessness, a natural leader of enthusiastic men.

2. He is a man of vision and keen foresight, and discriminating vision.

3. He organized New Hampshire on the most progressive lines. He is a man of ideas and knows how to put them in operation and can organize a working staff in short order.

William M. Davidson, Superintendent of Schools, Pittsburgh

1. He has successfully advanced every charge given him: Topeka, Washington, Pittsburgh. He has good common sense and is a strong man.

2. He is capable, genial, constructive, courageous.

3. In the front rank, progressive, strong in organizing.

4. Able with the gift of leadership, progressive, and full of enthusiasm.

5. Ballot without comment.

Edward B. Shallow, Associate Superintendent, New York

1. He has shown a steady advance based upon successful experience from the country school upward.

2. Ballot without comment.

3. Ballot without comment.

Martin G. Brumbaugh, Governor, Pennsylvania

1. Because he is the most constructive, inspirational educational leader in the country. His record is conclusive proof.

Henry Snyder, Superintendent of Schools, Jersey City

1. He has equipment, personality, experience. He knows New York and its needs.

John H. Francis, Superintendent of Schools, Columbus

1. Judge him by the splendid work of Los Angeles. He is practical, untried, devoted to the needs of to-day and tomorrow.

William L. Ettinger, Associate Superintendent, New York

1. Known for vocational work.

2. Not free from personal bias, but has had successful experience as an administrator.

3. His reading books and vocational schools are widely known.

4. He has worked out special plans of administration.

5. He has become known through his plan of school organization.

6. He is best known as an organizer.

7. He is believed to be a good organizer and an educational expert.

8. He is plus for vocational training are well known.

9. He is known as a vigorous organizer of practical courses in his schools.

10. The author of the Ettinger system of school organization.

11. He is known by his alternating plan.

12. Ballot without comment.

13. Ballot without comment.

14. Ballot without comment.

15. Ballot without comment.

James B. Scrymser, Cable Line Builder, Dies at Age of 79

James A. Scrymser, president of the Mexican and the Central and South American Telegraph companies, died at his home yesterday at the age of seventy-nine.

After